

This work is funded, in large part, by the National Science Foundation (Award #s 1758238 and 210217).

Working Together to Center Justice in Science Education

April Luehmann, Ph.D. (she/her) Associate Professor Warner Graduate School of Education University of Rochester, Rochester NY

November 17, 2023 Northern Arizona University





TABLE OF CONTENTS

O1 GET REAL! Science

The Teacher Ed Program

02 JuST FRAMEWORK

Our Sacrificial Text and Anchor

03 Culture-Setting UNIT Enacting the Vision

04 Networked PLCS Design-based Research





Get Real! Science **01** Teacher Education

15-month Scaffolded Master's Program: Outside of School learning to teach as precursor to School-based learning to teach.

What do you want to see?



Learning Targets for Today:

 I can explain the relationship between temperature and solubility for solid and gas solutes, and compare the solubility of two solutes.

tts tu

Language Target for the Day:

- I can use words like solubility to describe the relationship between two solutes

Start with student ideas

0 = 0 = 1 = 4 -----2022 class digital norms · Bring chromebook & charger to school and home o Participate in the Peardeck (Be Ionacions) March 16 A-Dau o Cherry Google Classroom and your e-mail of " der to be i proceture advocate for yourse 2 1 DESCRIPTION DECEM





Practice-Based Teacher Education







Challenges

- "Apprenticeship of observation" (Lortie, 1978)
- Institutional inertia
- Challenges of enactment and complexity
- Inequity students bring diverse sensemaking repertoires; those not aligned with dominant culture are often ignored and erased.

"Teaching well depends on having a flexible repertoire of high-leverage strategies and techniques that can be deployed quickly with good judgment."

> Matsaumoto-Rovo & Ramierz-Montova (2021)

What counts and how do we decide?

Introduction

Identity Development As a Lens to Science Teacher Preparation

APRIL LYNN LUEHMANN

Warner Graduate School of Education and Human Development, University of Rochester, Dewey Hall 1-160L, Rochester, NY 14627, USA

Received 15 August 2006; revised 30 January 2007; accepted 31 January 2007

DOI 10.1002/sce.20209

Published online 6 March 2007 in Wiley InterScience (www.interscience.wiley.com).

ABSTRACT: Concepts and findings from research on identity development are employed to better understand why current science teacher preparation programs are failing to prepare teachers who are able and choose to implement the vision for science education articulated in professional standards. Identity theory is used as a theoretical lens to make sense of and better address some of the unique challenges of becoming a reform-minded science teacher, a professional identity that does not reflect the common norm in the profession; these challenges include the emotional risk and possible need for "repair work," lack of familiarity with and buy-in into complex practices of inquiry, and the need for opportunities to participate in competent practice and have this participation acknowledged. Two basic design principles for science teacher preparation are identified as a result of this analysis: (a) the need to create safe places and scaffolded ways for beginning science teachers to try on and develop their identities as reform-minded science teachers, which may include capitalizing on the unique opportunities of practice teaching in out-of-school contexts; and (b) the need to offer opportunities to be recognized, by self and others, as reform-minded teachers through ongoing, structured, and supported reflection. © 2007 Wiley Periodicals, Inc. Sci Ed 91:822-839, 2007

INTRODUCTION AND OVERVIEW

A number of influential documents (e.g., American Association of Advancement of Science, 1993; National Research Council [NRC], 1996, 2000) advocate for a new vision for school science, comprising principles, standards, and practices that are grounded on research in the learning sciences. However, this vision is still far from becoming a reality, as there are very few "reform-minided" science teachers currently implementing this type of practice (Anderson, 2002; Tobin, Tippins, & Gallard, 1994; Wells, 1995). Even more troublesome is the realization that today's teacher preparation programs are usually not well equipped to prepare a new generation of reform-minded science teachers, able and willing to engage in the practices identified as most promising to improve science learning for all students (Windschit), 2020b). Why is this the case, and what can we do about it?

Teacher Learning as Identity Development More than knowing & doing, it's

about *becoming* a certain kind of teacher

Luehmann, A. L. (2007). Identity development as a lens to science teacher preparation. Science education, 91(5), 822-839.



Participation

"D"iscourse: ways of combining & integrating language, actions, interactions, ways of thinking, believing, valuing, using various symbols, tools & objects to enact a particular, socially recognizable identity. -Gee, 2001





Participation

"D"iscourse: ways of combining & integrating language, actions, interactions, ways of thinking, believing, valuing, using various symbols, tools & objects to enact a particular, socially recognizable identity. -Gee, 2001



Recognition

Not All Opportunities are Equal

- Positioning (activity, agency, accountability)
- Support (expertise, feedback, recognition)



Luehmann, 2008; Nasir & Hand, 2002

Identity Work Participation that is Authentic

 Messy, complex, unpredictable, non-linear, long-term



- Use of authentic tools:
 cognitive as well as physical Challenges
 & social
- Collaborative & creative
- Prioritizes relationships

- Novices engaging in the complexity of experts
- "Institutional inertia" over time and across participants

Identity Work Recognition that is Meaningful

- Identity = the stories that are told
- Most impactful are the stories one tells about oneself
- Role of "significant narrators"



Challenges

- Opportunities to construct "stories"
- Feedback & assessments that align with ambitious practice

Nurturing Damaged or New Identities

- Multiple opportunities to try & fail
- Reasons to invest a lot of effort
- Likelihood of experiencing meaningful success

Gee, 2003





 Phase 1: Summer A - Conceptual -Place-based core practices as learners (rural)



Windschitl, 2002

- Phase 1: Summer A Conceptual -Place-based practices as learners (rural)
- Phase 2: Summer B Conceptual & pedagogical: Place-based core practices as teachers in camp (rural)



- Phase 1: Summer A Conceptual -Place-based practices as learners (rural)
- Phase 2: Summer B Conceptual & pedagogical: Place-based practices as teachers in camp (rural)
- Phase 3: Fall Conceptual, pedagogical & cultural: Place-based core practices in afterschool club (urban)



Windschitl, 2002

- Phase 1: Summer A Conceptual -Place-based practices as learners (rural)
- Phase 2: Summer B Conceptual & pedagogical: Place-based practices as teachers in camp (rural)
- Phase 3: Fall Conceptual, pedagogical & cultural: Place-based practices in afterschool club (urban)
- Phase 4: Spring Conceptual, pedagogical, cultural & political: Core practices as teachers in school (edu 448, spring)



GRS RECOGNITION WORK



Luehmann & Borasi, 2011



sher 2005 - think

No sa Posted by melais under Uncategorized No Commenta

as been very tough for me so far. One thing that has been very humbling beiming() is the amount of time I feel like I am (urt keeping my head above really hard feeling like I don't know what I am doing a lot of the time! It was to a head today and fortunately at for 5 pm this evening, my mentor walled Ice and I had a very badly needed and worthwhile "talk" with her, b4000 it iderectionate going to those around you, even if you've asked them a million upport you.

been thinking about how to sequence the curriculum topics in a way that is students. I would like to maximize relevancy and connections in the way aught and can epring off each other. He are going from unit to unit on major



Currently Brow You are contently brown

the Ha about the journe the destination well archives for September



t there diam'r









Identity Work Opportunities to Try; Reason to Invest; Meaningful Success



The JuST FRAMEWORK

Our Sacrificial Text and Anchor

What is Justice-Centered Ambitious Science Teaching (JuST)?

Sets of high leverage practices that synthesize Ambitious Science Teaching (Windschitl, et al., 2018) with those of justice-centering (e.g. Morales-Doyle, 2017)

- Grounded in critical consciousness
- Responsive to and sustains students' cultures and communities
- Dependent on teachers' interpretive power to invite, recognize and build on students' expansive sensemaking repertoires
- Committed to naming and disrupting oppression and injustice in society.

Luehmann, et al., under review

Ambitious Science Teaching (Windschitl, Thompson & Braaten, 2018)

Pressing for evidence-based explanations Planning for engagement with important ideas

Supporting ongoing changes in thinking

Eliciting students' ideas Access to the "Culture of Power" (Delpit, 1988; Ladson-Billings, 1995)

Nurturing Positive Identities with Science through Authentic Engagement (Brown, 2005; Chapman & Feldman, 2017)

NEXT GENERATION SCIENCE STANDARDS

For States, By States









Luehmann, A. (2022). Justice-centered community–university partnering: Core tenets of partnering for justice epistemology. *Science Education*, 106(6), 1346-1353.



Planning for engagement with important ideas



JuST 3



JuST 4

"We don't trash your home, so don't trash ours. We live here." -Silo Student, published on a sign displayed in the community.	JuST 4. Use Science Learning for Positive Change Pressing for evidence-based explanations	JuST 1. Planning to be meaningful & justice-focused Planning for engagement with important ideas
	Supporting ongoing changes in thinking Thinking with Community & Diverse Expertise	Eliciting students' ideas JuST 2. Legitimizing Community Stories



The students who presented at family science night were positioned as producers of scientific knowledge. Through this experience, students' commitments to their communities and cultures of origin were strengthened as they recognized the value of their cultural competence. Meanwhile they also reflected upon their agency to impact issues in their community and in the broader world.

Morrales-Doyle, 2017, p. 1054-1055





"One insight relevant to teaching is that instruction should be organized to invite diversity in pathways of participation in learning activities and bring multiple knowledges to bear on learning academic content. If we know that learning, at best, engages a multiplicity of cultural repertoires of practice (Guitiérrez & Rogoff, 2003) and involves multiple representations and ways of knowing, then it is imperative that teaching start from a place of respecting the range of knowledge and epistemologies learners bring to the learning setting and have the capacity to connect learning and provide a range of entryways into core academic content."

-NASIR, LEE, PEA & MCKINNEY DE ROYSTON, 2021









IDEOS PRESENTERS FACILITATORS









NSF Awards: 1758238

NSF Noyce Scholars graduate from teacher preparation programs ready to advocate for transformative changes in science and math education. This film tells the story of how, when COVID struck, five of these Noyce Scholars joined with other teachers to create something that would not only help their students keep their circles



A Culture-Setting Unit

First unit of the year

Model for kinds of

Adapted to local

Pre-assessment

The power of the

preview... "Remember

engagement

contexts

when we..."

Groundwork for

critical, caring &

joy-filled community

What is it conceptually?

A Culture-Setting Unit

What is it practically?



	Class Activity	Purpose	
1	Identity mapping	Build a welcoming community	
2	Local zip code data analysis; Initial modeling of local phenomenon	Why are People of Color disproportionately impacted? Anchoring Phenomenon Routine	
3	Mask investigations	Design an original investigation	
4	Debate: Is a mask necessary when 6-ft distance is maintained?	Construct an argument	
5	Medical mentor interviews	Connect with local physicians	
6	Contact tracing	Analyze personal and local data	
7	Model revisions	Draw evidence-based explanations	
8	Myth busters for families	Communicate science to help keep circles safe	



Localized & Justice-Centered Anchoring Phenomenon





	Population (counted in 2010 Census)	% of population with COVID cases	Number of COVID- related deaths
Community A	20,565	0.48%	35 (county)
Community B	210,452	1.04%	295 (county)
Community C	2,502	0.20%	35 (county)
Community D	31,426	0.30%	295 (county)

Anchoring Phenomenon: The COVID-19 pandemic is being experienced by different communities in different ways

1. Google "COVID in [INSERT YOUR AREA]".

and along different timelines.

- 2. Investigate the data (ex. Check out different section of the graph, zoom in and out on the map, etc.)
- 3. What do you notice and wonder about the data?







Student-led Experiment Design





Katrina Robinson Warner '20 Penfield, NY

Experience Question Design **Experiment Share!**

Community **Connections:**

Positioning Students as Agents of Change

James Kostka, Warner '18 South Bronx, NY

Dr. Uzoamaka Odoemena. Strong Memorial Hospital

Evaluating Sources with CRAA

- Currency the timeliness of information
- When was the information published or posted? Has the information been revised or update Is the information current or out of date? Are the links functional?
- Relevance the importance of the information for your needs Does the information relate to your topic or answer your question? Who is the intended aud
- Authority the source of the information

So why exactly are these

misconceptions dangerous?

OK, so you explained why the

makes them trustworthy? Some

safe yet ...

people might not believe they are

vaccines are safe. But what exactly

Group 5

Focus Question: Is the covid vaccine safe? And Is it trustworthy?

Myths and/or Misconceptions

- President Joe Biden announced his latest effort to stop the spread of COVID-19, he will be putting Americans who have chosen to not be vaccinated, into 'quarantine camps' where they will be detained indefinitely until they get their shorts. - Osiris Foux, The Stock Market,
- The New York Times will tell you that, as of Feb, 16, over 487,000 Americans have died from COVID-19, but I sav it's all hogwash, All these lizard-people will tell you that it's all about the health of "The Public," but I don't know who that is, and I don't care. No one I know personally has died from COVID-19, so it simply can't be real! - Sophia Pan, Spoke News, 2021

The Facts and Science:

- "The FDA's approval of this vaccine is a milestone as we continue to battle the COVID-19 pandemic. While this and other vaccines have met the FDA's rigorous, scientific standards for emergency use authorization, as the first FDA-approved COVID-19 vaccine, the public can be very confident that this vaccine meets the high standards for safety, effectiveness, and manufacturing quality the FDA requires of an approved product," - Acting FDA Commissioner Janet Woodcock, M.D. This important because the FDA is the one in charge of the public health on ensuring the safety on food supply, cosmetic, and products that
- "To date, the systems in place to monitor the safety of these vaccines have found only two serious types of health problems after vaccination, both of which are rare. These are anaphylaxis and thrombosis with thrombocytopenia syndrome (TTS) after vaccination with J&J/Janssen COVID-19 Vaccine." The pfizer and the moderna vaccine both have a 90% or more of effectiveness against covid, there would be side effects like, redness on the spot you were given the vaccine, tiredness and swelling which would be a normal reaction to the vaccine. CDC, 2021)



determine its reliability?

02: How can we pull in expert opinions to inform our local perspective?

03: How can we provide space for collaborative conversations with our stakeholders?

Q4: How can I communicate to and for people I care about keeping safe?

FAQ: Mask For Covid-19

Facts About Masks:

I believe the most effective way to end the global pandemic is wearing masks. in the article Face Aask Reatly Do Matter. The Scientific Evidence Is Growing, it says, "Face masks are emerging as one of the most powerful weapons to fight the new coronavirus, with growing evidence that facial coverings help prevent transmission-even if an infected wearer is in close contact with others.Face masks are emerging as one of the most powerful weapons to fight the new coronavirus, with growing evidence that facial coverings help prevent transmission-even if an infected wearer is in close contact with others. This evidence shows that face masks really are effective. It shows how wearing a mask can prevent the spread of the Covid-19 virus.

believe the most effective way to end the global pandemic is by wearing mask. In the article Wear A Mask To Protect Yourself And Others, it states, "Masking is a critical public health tool and it is important to remember that any mask is better than no mask." This evidence proves that masks are a great safety source for protection against the Covid-19 virus.

I believe the most effective way to end the global pandemic is to wear mask. In the article Eace Mask During The Covid-19 Pandemic, it says, "Wearing face masks is recommended as part of personal protective equipment and as a public health measure to prevent the spread of coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) pandemic."

> **Common Misconceptions About Masks:** 1) Shortness of breath and may lead to death Response: This information is false. Masks are very breathable and are made up of breathable fibers. This is how it fails the CRAAP test.

2) A way to control people Response: This information is false. Masks are a way to protect people and their own health. This is how it fails the CRAAP test.



The work of each PLC

GET KEAL!

Summer PD

GET REAL!

Justice-centered Ambitious pedagogy Working as a PLC OVID Culture Setting Unit **Study** Implement, evaluate and revise Covid

Lesson

RFAL

Chemistry Connects

JuST

Brynne's Chem Crew

Chemistry Teachers working in Urban Settings

> Practice Identify valuable and effective justice-centered ambitious science teaching practices



DESIGN-BASED IMPLEMENTATION RESEARCH

 PLC Name:
 Chem Crew
 Date:
 Fall 2021

 Name of Your DBIR Study:
 Conceptually-rich questioning

What is your persistent problem of practice? What struggle did you decide you all face that you want to collaboratively work on?

Students' contributions are not conceptually-rich

What strategy did you decide to try to address this Persistent Problem of Practice?

Teach, monitor & share data on higher-order questioning

Why do you think this strategy will be effective?

Students ownership in what counts and why Recognition See value as students build on each other's ideas

How will your PLC collaboratively measure and analyze the effectiveness of the strategy? Data table: Level 1, 2, 3 questions by class & student over time Student feedback on perceived value of the process



JuST Practices by Teachers for Teachers

WHERE ELSE IN YOUR LIFE HAVE YOU SEEN THINGS ACT LIKE A ROCKET LAUNCHING?



JuST Practice

Identify valuable and effective justice-centered ambitious science teaching practices







THANKS!

DO YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS?

april.luehmann@rochester.edu <u>COVID Connects Us</u> <u>Get Real Science</u>



CREDITS: This presentation template was created by **Slidesgo**, and includes icons by **Flaticon** and infographics & images by **Freepik**



JuST Lab: 80 Secondary Science Teachers + April Luehmann, University of Rochester Yang Zhang, Northwestern University Todd Campbell, University of Connecticut Hannah Cooke, University of Connecticut Déana Scipio, Islandwood Environmental Ed. Priya Pugh, Islandwood Environmental Ed.